

Icarus Review Submission(11/18/07 at 13:22:27 EST)

MANUSCRIPT: I10258

AUTHORS: M. Shepard et al

SHORT TITLE: Radar observations of E-class asteroids...

Reviewer: Michael Gaffey

REVIEW SUMMARY

- (a). Do you recommend that this manuscript be accepted for publication?
Yes, without change or with revision essentially at the

 authors' discretion
- (b). The overall length of the text in this manuscript is:
About right to describe the work and its significance
- (c). The amount of display material (tables and figures) is:
About right

COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHORS

This manuscript presents interesting and significant results without trying to extend the interpretations beyond the scope of the data. It is clearly and concisely written. I could identify no errors in the discussion or in the figures.

My one potential concern is focused on the as-yet-unpublished work of Benner et al. (2007, submitted to Science), which the present manuscript draws upon significantly. My concern is that the E-type NEOs described as having high polarization ratios are most likely identified using the Bus and Binzel taxonomic classification. Those classifications are not very robust because of a lack of albedo information and the E-type NEO sample might actually include a significant diversity.

However, I do not think that this constitutes a major shortcoming of the present manuscript, and I would recommend publication in its present form.